## LAW OFFICES BLOOSTON, MORDKOFSKY, DICKENS, DUFFY & PRENDERGAST, LLP

2120 L STREET, NW, SUITE 300 WASHINGTON, DC 20037

HAROLD MORDKOFSKY
BENJAMIN H. DICKENS, JR.
JOHN A. PRENDERGAST
GERARD J. DUFFY
RICHARD D. RUBINO
MARY J. SISAK
D. CARY MITCHELL
SALVATORE TAILLEFER

(202) 659-0830 FACSIMILE: (202) 828-5568 AFFILIATED SOUTH AMERICAN OFFICES

ESTUDIO JAUREGUI & ASSOCIATES
BUENOS AIRES, ARGENTINA

ROBERT M. JACKSON OF COUNSEL

PERRY W. WOOFTER
LEGISLATIVE CONSULTANT

EUGENE MALISZEWSKYJ ENGINEERING CONSULTANT

ARTHUR BLOOSTON

October 28, 2013

Marlene H. Dortch Office of the Secretary Federal Communications Commission 445 12th Street, SW Room TW-A325 Washington, D.C. 20554

Attention: Suzanne Yelen

Re: Written *Ex Parte* Presentation in WC Docket Nos. 10-90 and 05-337 Application for Review of Silver Star Telephone Company, Inc.

Dear Ms. Dortch:

Silver Star Telephone Company, Inc. (Silver Star), hereby submits shapefiles showing the actual road miles and road crossings within Silver Star's Idaho and Wyoming study areas; a description of the methodology used to determine the actual roads and road crossings in the study areas; and the certification of an officer of Silver Star concerning the accuracy of the information presented. Silver Star is providing this information as a result of its meetings with Commission staff concerning Silver Star's pending Application for Review of the Wireline Competition Bureau's (WCB's) Order denying, in part, Silver Star's requests for expedited waiver of the regression model.

As shown in the Application for Review and as discussed in the *ex parte* meetings, the ESRI StreetMap data does not accurately reflect road miles and road crossings in Silver Star's study areas. Silver Star's position is supported by the actual data provided in this filing. Therefore, Silver Star asks the Commission to correct the road miles and road crossing data used in the regression model. Silver Star requests that the corrections be applied to the benchmark methodology effective July 1, 2012. For future runs of the Quantile Regression Analysis Model, either actual Silver Star data on road miles and road crossings prepared in conformance with the methodology described herein or the most recent data for Silver Star on file with the Commission would be used.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The shapefiles are being provided on a CD-Rom to Suzanne Yelen of the Wireline Competition Bureau and they are not being filed electronically.

Please contact me if you have any questions concerning this filing.

Sincerely,

/s/Mary J. Sisak

Enclosure: (CD-Rom hand delivered only)

#### Attachment

cc: Julie Veach

Steve Rosenberg Rodger Woock Suzanne Yelen Craig Stroup I am Ron B. McCue, President and Chief Operating Officer of Silver Star Telephone Company, Inc. I hereby certify that I have overall responsibility for the preparation of all data in the attached shapefiles and documentation related to Quantile Regression Analysis inputs for Silver Star Telephone Company, Inc. and that I am authorized to execute this certification.

Based on the information known to me or provided to me by employees or consultants responsible for the preparation of the data in this submission, I hereby certify that the data has been examined and reviewed and are complete, accurate, and consistent with the databases available to Silver Star Telephone Company, Inc.

Date: October 28, 2013

Certifying Signature:

Pan B. McCue

Name: Ron B. McCue

Title: President & C.O.O.

Silver Star Telephone Company, Inc.

# Description of the Methodology to Determine Road Miles and Road Crossings

#### **Introduction and Background**

As shown in the waiver petitions filed by Silver Star Telephone Company, Inc. (Silver Star) and in its Application for Review, Silver Star discovered that the data in the regression model did not accurately reflect the road miles and road crossings in Silver Star's Idaho and Wyoming study areas. As shown in its filings and as discussed with the Wireline Competition Bureau (WCB) in *ex parte* communications, many of the roads and road crossings that are not reflected in the regression model data are associated with housing subdivisions that were constructed between the years 2000 and 2010.

Silver Star's service territory sits outside of the resort area and community of Jackson, Wyoming (Jackson Hole) in Teton County, Wyoming. A large part of Silver Star's Idaho and Wyoming study areas have become "bedroom communities" for the many people of modest means who work in and need access to the Jackson resort area.

To accommodate the growing Jackson area, land development in Silver Star's study areas during the mid-1990's and continuing all through the 2000 to 2009 time frame, was at an all-time high and agricultural land was being consumed for the development of subdivisions at an astronomical rate. During this time period, Silver Star placed telecommunications facilities to over 400 subdivisions; ranging in varying lot numbers from as few as five to as many as 2,200 lots per subdivision.

Silver Star is certificated as a Public Telecommunications Utility by the Wyoming Public Service Commission and the Idaho Public Utilities Commission in its Wyoming and Idaho study areas, respectively. As such, Silver Star was required as the Carrier of Last Resort, to provide telecommunications services to, around, and within any subdivision that was developed, which it did willingly in full compliance with its obligations and authority.

When the ESRI StreetMap data was quantitatively compared to the actual data contained in Silver Star's mapping system and the publicly available mapping and plat data provided by the Idaho Counties of Caribou, Bonneville and Teton and the Wyoming Counties of Lincoln and Teton, it became very clear that the StreetMap data had completely missed 283 subdivisions that had been developed during the subdivision boom phase of the late 1990's and the 2000's. In a significant number of these subdivisions, homes had been built, cable and facilities placed and services were being provided. Yet the StreetMap database reflected none of these new roads. As a result, substantial numbers of road crossings and road miles were under reported. In turn, the Quantile Regression Analysis (QRA) model, which utilizes ESRI StreetMap data, failed to

4

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See, Notices of Ex Parte Presentations filed on August 21, 2013 and September 3 and 16, 2013, in WC Docket Nos. 10-90 and 05-337, by Mary J. Sisak, Counsel for Silver Star.

properly compensate Silver Star for the expenses and capital associated with facilities that served actual customers.

In *ex parte* presentations, Silver Star discussed with the Wireline Competition Bureau (WCB) how to determine an accurate representation of road mile and road crossing data to be used for the purposes of the QRA model. It was determined that in order to be accurate and measureable, Silver Star would utilize its own base mapping data reflecting roads, road crossings, subdivisions, cable service areas and routes which was developed using Silver Star data in concert with town, city, county, state, Bureau of Land Management and other publicly available data, and visual inspection by Silver Star.

#### Methodology and Process to Determine Road Miles and Road Crossings

To create the shapefiles provided with this filing showing the actual road miles and road crossings in Silver Star's study areas, Silver Star first replicated the data sources used by the FCC in order to provide a basis to perform the addition of the county platted subdivisions on top of the existing land based maps and any new roads or intersections that were developed prior to January 1, 2010 and the subtraction of roads that do not meet the criteria described below.

Silver Star then created a street centerline map with ESRI ArcGIS Advanced 10.2 software utilizing road and road crossing data from its own mapping system. Silver Star's own base mapping data reflect roads, road crossings, subdivisions, cable service areas and routes which was developed using Silver Star data in concert with town, city, county, state, Bureau of Land Management and other publicly available data, and visual inspection by Silver Star. All roads and road crossings in Silver Star's study areas are geocoded in its mapping system. For purposes of this analysis, Silver Star included the following as roads: 1) roads that are of public use and publicly maintained for multiple use; 2) roads maintained by county, city, state or other public body where the road is plowed of snow during the winter for access and general use; and 3) any road or intersection that contains Silver Star cable or facilities. Silver Star removed all driveways and single party use roads from the road data. Silver Star also removed all roads constructed on or after January 1, 2010.

Silver Star then created a combined centerline layer by using ESRI's StreetMap data as the starting point and then incorporating the Silver Star street centerline layer. Where centerline data was available, Silver Star also incorporated the county GIS data. All duplicate line markings were deleted.

Where ESRI showed a road and Silver Star's data did not, Silver Star verified whether or not a road existed by the use of ESRI's aerial photo base map or physical inspection. Street centerlines that occurred in areas where the aerial photo or physical inspection showed no road were deleted. Centerlines were added where ESRI did not show a road and Silver Star's geocode data did show a road.

The shapefiles being provided with this submission show the result of this process.

Road miles and road crossing calculations were done on this combined layer per the "Geospatial Data Creation Algorithms for HCLS Regressions" published by the FCC. Finally, Silver Star verified all counts manually by comparing them to an aerial view of the land base.

Through this process, Silver Star has verified the number of road miles and road crossings for its study areas. The number of road miles and road crossings for each study area is provided in Attachment A. As shown, the actual road miles and road crossings in Silver Star's study areas differ from the road mile and road crossing data previously provided in Silver Star's filings and do not match either ESRI or TigerLine data. This primarily is because various road miles and road crossings have been added to and deleted from both ESRI and Tiger Line data based on the criteria used by Silver Star to determine a "road" for the purpose of this analysis.

#### ATTACHMENT A

### 512295 Exchange (Wyoming)

SILVER STAR / StreetMap / County

Miles 690.69

Road Crossings 3,217

#### 472295 Exchange (IDAHO)

SILVER STAR /StreetMap /

County

Miles 2,245.34

Road Crossings 8,911